



**Box 1602, 5014-50th Avenue
Yellowknife, NT X1A 2P2
Ph. 867-675-0788 Fax 867-675-0789**

Ms. Natalie Plato
Deputy Director
Giant Mine Remediation Project
Aboriginal Affairs and Northern Development Canada

Lisa Dyer
Director
Environment Division
Department of Environment and Natural Resources
Government of the Northwest Territories

February 03, 2017

Final Response Table for Review of the 2015-2016 Annual Report Giant Mine Remediation Project

The Giant Mine Oversight Board (GMOB) has reviewed the Giant Mine Remediation Project Team's (GMRPT) response to the review recommendations made by GMOB for the 2015-2016 Annual Report of the Giant Mine Remediation Project (GMRP).

Please find attached the final response table and note that an assessment of the overall progress of the Project will form part of GMOB's annual report due in late March or early April, 2017.

In closing, we would like to thank the Project Team for your timely responsiveness. If you have any questions in this regard, please feel free to contact me directly or through the GMOB office.

Sincerely,

Dr. Kathy Racher
Chair, Giant Mine Oversight Board

Attachment

cc. Parties to the Environmental Agreement

#	Subject	GMOB Observation	GMOB Recommendation (November 3, 2016)	GMRP Response (December 12, 2016)	GMOB Response (February 3, 2017)
1	Plain Language Summary	The Agreement requires that the report contain a plain language summary. The Report Summary, on pages 8-11, is very technical and cannot, in our opinion, be classified as a “plain language” summary. A stand-alone, plain language summary document would be very beneficial for distribution to the Parties to the Agreement and the general public.	The GMRP should either revise the language of the Report Summary next year so that it is more accessible to readers at all levels of technical knowledge and/or that it provide a standalone plain language summary document. The latter document could be produced independently from the Annual Report and be made available for wider public distribution.	The GMRP will provide a plain language summary of this report for GMOB, as a template for future summaries that will form part of the report but also be available as a stand-alone document for wider circulation.	We look forward to reviewing the plain language summary and note the commitment by the GMRPT to include it in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.
2	Reporting Cycle	The reporting cycle for the Annual Report covers activities that took place from April 2015-March 2016 with mention of some activities that took place in 2014. As the Annual Report was provided to GMOB in October 2016 and we are now at the end of the field season for 2016, the reporting is one year behind the Project’s activities. The nature of the current reporting cycle means that there is little opportunity for Parties to use the Annual Report information as a basis for making recommendations for the next year’s Project activities.	GMOB would like discuss with the Project Team how best to maximize the utility of the Annual Report. For example, one way to address the reporting cycle issue might be through the presentation of a preliminary project report in May of each year so that feedback from GMOB and the community could be applied adequately to the following year’s planning cycle.	The Annual Report is intended to be a more comprehensive description of project activities and outcomes; there is no way to have a comprehensive report on a fiscal year basis any earlier, due to when information comes in, can be collated, organized and summarized and then approved. Our intention with sharing our 5-year work plan (with a focus on the upcoming fiscal year) with GMOB prior to each field season is to provide an opportunity for recommendations for upcoming activities.	The provision of a 5-year work plan along with the regular Project updates in the Working Group meetings may mitigate GMOB's concerns in this regard. Note that GMOB will be making further recommendations with respect to this issue in the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017.

<p>3</p>	<p>Annual Project Plan</p>	<p>There is no Project Plan included in the Annual Report. Without it, the process for reporting progress is not meaningful. The approved working plan is necessary so that cross-referencing of what was planned and what was delivered can be clearly followed and explained. The Annual Report, as it stands now, does not allow for an assessment of actual schedule performance against a baseline schedule on a multi-year basis. For example, does the current project status align with plans that were established 3 or 5 years ago? If not, why?</p>	<p>An Annual Project Plan be included in the Annual Report.</p>	<p>Our approved Annual Work Plan will be attached as an Appendix in future reports</p>	<p>Attachment of the approved Annual Work Plan as an appendix in future reports along with the GMRPT's commitment to provide a 5-year work plan may mitigate the concerns expressed by GMOB on this issue. Note that GMOB will be making further recommendations with respect to an overall Project Plan in the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017.</p>
<p>4</p>	<p>Performance Measures</p>	<p>There are no stated performance measures included in the Annual Report. Information in the Annual Report is listed as "objectives", either "commitments" or "vision". Without performance measures, it is hard to know whether mitigation measures are working as intended or expected.</p>	<p>Quantifiable performance measures should be further developed and included in the Annual Report.</p>	<p>Quantifiable performance measures will be developed for the implementation phase of the project. At this stage, while the remediation plan is still being developed, any performance targets are qualitative in nature. Also, the Department is updating its Performance Measurement framework in line with GoC objectives and so Giant will be updating its own performance targets to align with this initiative. In the</p>	<p>GMOB respectfully disagrees that it is not possible to define quantifiable performance measures prior to the initiation of full site remediation. Further recommendations on this topic will be provided in the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017.</p>

				meantime, specific in- year performance targets will continue to be monitored (i.e. project team performance in meeting the goals established in the annual Detailed Work Plan.	
5	Expenditures	The project expenditure figures are provided in the Annual Report as only a lump sum figure and there is no comparison of planned versus actual expenditures.	A further breakdown of the project expenditure figures as well as a multi-year trend analysis of the total cost estimate of spending versus budget would be helpful to include in future annual reports. The latter item should include a justification for any significant variances. The cost vs. budget trend analysis would help us to understand if and where there may be issues with scope creep, schedule slippage, etc.	GMRP will in the future provide a similar breakdown as the FCSAP categories (Care & Maintenance, Regulatory, Consultation, Investigation & Assessment, Remediation, Monitoring, Program Management), planned vs. actual. GMRP will explore options to create a separate annex for more detailed budget information, one that would not be released for general consumption.	GMOB looks forward to reviewing the GMRPT's proposed breakdown and/or annex prior to incorporation into the next Annual Report.
6	Trends	Contrary to what is stated in the Annual Report, we do feel that there is more than adequate historical information collected by the Project that could be analyzed for trends (e.g., water quality, health and safety indicators, engagement, socio-economic measures, and regulatory compliance).	There are many potential datasets that could be analyzed for trends but likely only a few key analyses would be truly useful. We recommend that the Project Team consult with the Parties to the Agreement as to what datasets should be analyzed for trend reporting in the Annual Report.	GMRP will examine ways to consult with the parties on how best to look at trend analysis through the working group.	GMOB requests that the GMRPT define how and when it plans to consult with the parties on this issue such that there will be sufficient time to incorporate changes into the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report. Please update GMOB as soon as possible with specifics of how the GMRPT will address this.
7	Air	The Annual Report refers to the Air Quality Monitoring Program and there are very helpful links to	The Air Quality Monitoring Plan should be referenced in the Annual Report	Agreed	GMOB will look for this reference in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.

		the monitoring data online. However, there is no reference or link provided to the current Air Quality Monitoring Plan. As a result, an assessment of the basis for the current monitoring program is not possible.	and a link to the plan provided.		
8	Water	The report includes information on the outfall design/location, the potential re-routing of Baker Creek, and the design of the new Effluent Treatment Plant (ETP) and the development of the site-specific water quality objectives (SSWQO) but there is no clear explanation of how these important items relate or how work on these items will be sequenced. In addition, we note that unlike the air quality monitoring results, the GMRP does not seem to have any way of sharing water quality monitoring results from routine or special studies. Finally, there is mention of a settling pond dredge being removed but we were unable to find mention of how the dredge was managed after removal.	It would be helpful if the Annual Report could provide a roadmap and timeline as to how the outfall design, the re-routing of Baker Creek, the ETP design and the development of SSWQO relate to each other and how the Project team plans to sequence work on these items. The GMRP should work with the Parties to develop a way of sharing key water monitoring data as is done for air quality. All operational details, such as the dredge removal, should be followed through in future Annual Reports.	Future reports will have an expanded sections, or provide links/references to more detailed information.	GMOB requests further discussion with the GMRPT with respect to what kinds of routine water monitoring data could be made available on an ongoing basis and how this information would be shared. GMOB will also look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.
9	Biodiversity	In the section on Biodiversity, there does not seem to be a direct link between monitoring results and actions for	As written, it is not clear what the objective of monitoring wildlife/birds is or what mitigations or	Future reports will describe how the monitoring results are incorporated into work planning (i.e. considerations when	GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.

		biodiversity components. For wildlife and birds, the actions are to consider results or recommendations in the future for remediation design but no further detail is provided. For EEM monitoring, the only action listed is to continue monitoring.	plans this monitoring will inform. It would be helpful if there was a more systematic way to link the results of monitoring to corrective actions or to design planning.	planning physical work at the site) as well as how the results will be incorporated into the overall remediation planning and execution.	
10	Land	Much of the work to date in this section of the Annual Report deals with soil sampling and characterization, which will inform a remediation plan.	No specific recommendation; however, we will be very interested in reviewing the proposed soil remediation plan, including the development of soil criteria, as this aspect of the Project moves forward.	Acknowledged	We look forward to reviewing the proposed soil remediation plan, including the development of soil criteria, as this aspect of the Project moves forward.
11	Health	In the section on Health and Safety in the Annual Report, it would be helpful to have an analysis on the effectiveness of the measures used to address the exceedances of urinalysis tests for onsite workers. The current work in the next year on the Human Health Risk Assessment and the Health Effects Monitoring Program will be very important elements that GMOB will be tracking.	The Annual Report should include a section on the effectiveness of the measures used to address the exceedances of urinalysis tests for present onsite workers.	Future reports will describe how to the monitoring results have improved our Health & Safety practices at the site, our understanding of arsenic risks as they relate to on-site workers, as well as how the results will be incorporated into the overall remediation planning and execution.	GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.
12	Community and Engagement	The number of attendees at engagement events is not very meaningful without an analysis of the concerns identified by the	This section of the Annual Report could to be strengthened by, for example, including an analysis of concerns identified during engagement	Future reports will describe engagement particulars, and how these are shared within the project for consideration when conducting work,	GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report. The GMRPT may also want to consider

		<p>attendees and what will/is being done to address these concerns. The efforts to heal the legacy issues created by the long history of the mine, as well as previous Project activities, also remain to be addressed. Perhaps it is beyond the scope of the Project Team to deal with activities outside the immediate remediation but it is within the purview of the Co-Proponents to undertake a long-term proactive community based healing process.</p>	<p>and how those concerns are being addressed.</p>	<p>planning activities, and incorporated into lessons learned and the overall remediation planning and execution.</p>	<p>responding to the concerns GMOB has summarized in the "What We Heard" section of the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017. It would be beneficial to all parties if there were a formal mechanism to record concerns raised as well as follow-up or responses.</p>
13	Employment	<p>The employment data provided in the Annual Report does not provide sufficient detail to allow analysis. For example, the figures provided are not clear as to whether each group reported is separate and distinct from each other. There is little information on the number of contractors, value of contracts and jobs created etc.</p>	<p>The Annual Report should provide more detailed information on employment, contractors and value of contracts as well as any other information linked to direct socio-economic activity. The Project team should consult with GMOB and the Parties about exactly what kinds of information would be most useful to report on.</p>	<p>This is very difficult metric to report on, as all reporting is voluntary. But we can commit to working with GMOB and Parties to try to improve on reporting. There are provisions within the future Main Construction Manager contract that should improve the quality of data we get on socio-economic aspects of the project.</p>	<p>GMOB continues to believe that its recommendation is achievable by the GMRPT and will make itself available to work with the GMRPT on this issue. GMOB also requests that the GMRPT define how and when it plans to consult with the parties on this issue so that there will be sufficient time to incorporate changes into the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report. Please update GMOB as soon as possible with specifics of how the GMRPT will address this issue</p>
14	Training	<p>It is not clear, if the training information in the Annual Report is comprehensive or only drawn from contractors who are</p>	<p>The Project team should consider including a section in the report that describes the overall socio-economics of</p>	<p>Additional clarity will be provided in future reports. There are provisions within the future Main Construction</p>	<p>GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report. Note that GMOB will be</p>

		required to deliver Health and Safety and Orientation sessions to their workers. The Project itself could be much more proactive in its efforts to identify how and what local training, employment opportunities and economic spinoffs to the community were maximized.	the Project including, for example, comprehensive and measurable local training and employment initiatives as well as secondary economic effects of the project.	Manager contract that should improve the quality of data we get on socio-economic aspects of the project.	making further recommendations with respect to this issue in the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017.
15	Traditional Knowledge	There is no mention of consultations regarding traditional knowledge or the incorporation of any traditional knowledge for project activities in the Annual Report. This is an important aspect of the Project team's community consultation and project planning.	A specific section reporting on consultation and incorporation of traditional knowledge should be included in the Annual Report.	Agreed	GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report
16	Off-Site Considerations	The surface contamination that is present within the Project boundaries extends to off-site locations. The Annual Report does not indicate how the Project Team is working with the applicable authorities to ensure the effective and consistent management of both off and onsite contamination.	The Annual Report should describe how the Project Team is working with applicable authorities to ensure the effective and consistent management of both off and on site contamination.	This can be included in future annual reports as part of our report on engagement. The Project does not lead on this, but is a participant in discussions through the INAC NWT Regional Office.	GMOB understands that the GMRPT is not itself responsible for the off-site issues; however, the Co-Proponents are responsible. Note that GMOB will be making further recommendations with respect to this issue in the GMOB Establishment Report to be released in early 2017. GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report.
17	Emergency Measures	The Annual Report does not reflect what the criteria is for work to be categorized as an emergency measure versus care	The Annual Report should provide the criteria and rationale used to categorize on-site activities that are deemed to be of an	Agreed	GMOB will look for these proposed changes in the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report

		<p>and maintenance. GMOB would like to understand how the Project makes these determinations. There is also no mention in the Annual Report of any Emergency Preparedness Plan to deal with potential system or structural failures.</p>	<p>emergency measure and describe or provide a link to an Emergency Preparedness Plan.</p>		
18	<p>Plans to Incorporate New Remediation Technologies in the Future</p>	<p>There is no information in the Annual Report explaining how the Project Team intends to address potential changes in remediation technologies, techniques, or processes that may be recommended because of the research program currently undertaken by GMOB. For example, how will the Project Team's remediation plan address future access to stopes and access to the site for possible arsenic trioxide remediation?</p>	<p>The Annual Report should outline the process and actions taken to address any potential changes in remediation technologies, techniques, or processes that may be recommended as a result of the research program currently undertaken by GMOB.</p>	<p>Additional detail will be provided in future reports, in the context of remediation planning.</p>	<p>GMOB looks forward to seeing how the GMRPT will incorporate additional detail about how future changes in remediation technologies will be accommodated. GMOB expects that the 2016-2017 Giant Mine Annual Report will begin to address this issue.</p>